**Additional File 2: Inconsistencies that support credibility issues**

We observed many contradictions between and within the text of all five newspapers examined. The main discrepancies found are summarized here.

**1. Landslide chronology**

In La Repubblica (article. 1, p. 14, 31/12/2002) a single landslide was reported to have occurred at 13:14 (local time) on 30 December 2002. In La Sicilia, two timings were reported for two landslides at 13:20 and 13:40(article. 2, p. 3, 31/12/2002 and article. 1, p. 3. 02/01/2003) , which later became 13:13 and 13:20 (article.1, p. 3, 02/01/2003). In Corriere della Sera, another two different timings were reported for the two landslides: 13:12 and 13:14, respectively (article. 1, p. 9, 31/12/2002). In La Gazzetta del Sud, the landslide was reported once only on 30/12/2002, at 13:15 p.m (article. 1, p. 2, 31/12/2002). In a second article, published on 3 January 2003 (article. 1, p. 3, 03/01/2003), the landslides became two, with timings of 13:15 and 13:22.

**2. Tsunami chronology**

La Repubblica reported the timing for when the tsunami reached Milazzo as at 13:55 (article. 1, p. 14, 31/12/2002) , which (given a generation time of 13:14) is an arrival time of 41 minutes. In another article on the same day (article. 2, p. 14, 31/12/2002), La Repubblica reported that wave reached both Lipari and Vulcano islands in half an hour, which was 11 minutes short compared to the time provided by the first article.

**2. Evacuation statistics and images**

According to La Repubblica “almost 200” people, 162 from Stromboli and 12 from Ginostra, left the Island at 21:00 on 31 December 2002 (article. 1, p. 14, 31/12/2002). The same newspaper later reported that the 174 people (residents and tourists), who decided to leave the island, arrived in Lipari at 19:00 (article. 2, p. 14, 31/12/2002). The two articles present several discrepancies including the fact that it is not possible that 174 people reached Lipari at 19:00 having left the Stromboli at 21:00.

An image of a hydrofoil transporting people from Stromboli to Lipari was present in La Repubblica on 31 December 2002 (article. 1, p. 14, 31/12/2002). This was linked to a report entitled “Stromboli, the volcano landslide. Giant wave devastates the island”. The same image then reappeared in La Repubblica on 4 January 2003, associated with an article entitled *“*Tossed from Lipari to Milazzo, "Help, another freak wave" (Reference 28, Table 2). The applied to an image showing damaged boats on a beach of Stromboli published on 31 December 2002 in La Repubblica (article. 1, p. 14, 31/12/2002) . The image was reused on 2 January 2003 in the same journal (article. 1, p. 8, 02/01/2003) , but the caption ascribed it to Panarea, apparently showing boats thrown ashore there by tsunami, and not Stromboli.

Instead, the number of people who decided to leave the Island according to Corriere della Sera was “over 200” (article. 1, p. 9, 31/12/2002).